



CITY COUNCIL STAFF REPORT



September 27, 2022

ITEM TITLE

Parking Management: Approve the Downtown Chula Vista Parking Management Plan Report and Implement Recommendation Numbers 1, 9 and 11 of the Report

Report Number: 22-0215

Location: Downtown Parking District, bounded by E Street to the north, Del Mar Avenue to the east, Garrett Avenue to the west, and H Street to the south

Department: Development Services

Environmental Notice: The activity is not a "Project" as defined under Section 15378 of the California Environmental Quality Act ("CEQA") State Guidelines; therefore, pursuant to State Guidelines Section 15060(c)(3) no environmental review is required.

Recommended Action

Adopt a resolution approving the Downtown Chula Vista Parking Management Plan Report dated August 2022 and implementing Recommendations Number 1 (Smart Meters), 9 (Norman Park Senior Center Parking Lot – remove meters, extend to 4 hour parking limit) and 11 (increase Parking District boundary) of the Report.

SUMMARY

The Downtown Chula Vista Parking Management Plan (the "Downtown PMP") (Attachment 1) analyzes existing and projected future parking conditions within the Downtown Parking District (the "Parking District") and provides a series of recommendations to optimize parking facilities and parking availability throughout the Parking District. The Downtown PMP report is being presented to the City Council for their consideration. Additionally, Staff is requesting that Recommendation Number 1 (Smart Meters), Recommendation 9 (Norman Park Senior Center Parking Lot – remove meters, extend to 4 hour limit) and Recommendation 11 (increase Parking District boundary) of the Report be implemented with acceptance of the Downtown PMP.

ENVIRONMENTAL REVIEW

The Director of Development Services has reviewed the proposed activity for compliance with the CEQA and has determined that the activity is not a “Project” as defined under Section 15378 of the State CEQA Guidelines; therefore, pursuant to Section 15060(c)(3) of the State CEQA Guidelines, the activity is not subject to CEQA. Thus, no environmental review is required.

BOARD/COMMISSION/COMMITTEE RECOMMENDATION

The Downtown PMP was presented as an informational item to the Planning Commission on June 22, 2022.

DISCUSSION

Background

The Parking District encompasses a roughly 120-acre area in downtown Chula Vista bounded by E Street to the north, Del Mar Avenue to the east, H Street to the south, and Garrett Avenue to the west. Third Avenue, a major commercial thoroughfare, runs in a north/south direction through the center of the Parking District. Businesses fronting Third Avenue include bars, restaurants, offices, commercial shops, and numerous other uses. Within the Parking District, Third Avenue is characterized by wide sidewalks, streetscape improvements (such as curb bulb-outs and mid-block crosswalks), numerous store fronts and bar/restaurant entrances and dining areas, and angled on-street parking, all of which facilitate pedestrian access and circulation along this roadway. Memorial Park is located on the west side of the Third Avenue, between G Street and F Street, and the Third Avenue corridor is the site of numerous community-wide special events, such as the Día de los Muertos Celebration and the Lemon Festival. Areas outside of the Parking District are mostly residential, with single family and multi-family residences throughout. Over the past four years, there have been several multi-family projects constructed within the Parking District. Some examples include 288 Center Street (43 units), 230 Church Avenue (29 units), and 252 Church Avenue (31 units).

The Parking District includes 1,528¹ public parking spaces, which are located on-street, in surface parking lots, and in one multi-level parking structure located at 340 F Street (the “Park Plaza Parking Structure”) (Attachment 2). Of the 1,528 total spaces, approximately 47 percent are available at no charge. Paid parking facilities include the following:

- 460 on-street metered spaces (\$0.50 per hour)
- 15 off-street metered spaces at the Norman Park Senior Center (\$0.50 per hour)
- 329 spaces in six surface lots, including 213 spaces in four lots that charge \$0.25 per hour and the remaining 116 spaces in two lots charging \$0.50 per hour.

Hourly parking fees and parking time limitations within the surface lots (i.e., “pay lots”) are governed by Chula Vista Municipal Code (CVMC) Section 10.56.040. Parking time limitations in the pay lots range from two hours at the Norman Park Senior Center lot to up to 10 hours at pay lots 1, 3, 8, and 10. Parking fees and time limitations are enforced by the City between the hours of 9:00 am and 6:00 pm every day of the year except for Sundays and Holidays. Parking management activities, including revenue collection and citations,

¹ Including 21 on-street metered spaces located to the north of the Parking District boundary, but which are managed by the City in the same manner as the other 475 meters.

are performed by the City's parking management operator (currently ACE Parking Management, Inc.). Where there are time limitations for on-street parking spaces, the limitations are communicated to motorists by signs and/or painted curbs.

Previous Actions in the Parking District

The Parking District was formed on July 9, 1963 by Ordinance 847 under the provisions of the Parking District Law of 1943 (California Streets and Highways Code 31500 – 36745), which allows construction of parking facilities and imposition of parking fees. The original Parking District boundaries encompassed Third Avenue between E Street and G Street and for the most part did not extend to the current eastern and western boundaries of Del Mar Avenue and Garrett Avenue. In 1980, the City adopted the In-Lieu Parking Fee program, which was codified in CVMC Section 19.62.040. As described in CVMC Section 19.62.040A, the off-street parking requirement for a nonresidential use within a parking district is considered to be met provided that the proposed project pays the required fees. The amount of the in-lieu fee is calculated using the equation in Resolution No. 1980-9943, which is based in part on the fair market value of the land needed to accommodate a single surface parking space.

On December 15, 1983, the City Council adopted Resolution No. 461, Reciprocal Agreement of Easements and Declarations Establishing Restrictions and Covenants for the Town Center Focus Area Including Provisions for the Maintenance and Management of the Town Centre Parking Facility (Reciprocal Access Agreement). The Reciprocal Access Agreement was between the City and the owners of six commercial parcels located immediately adjacent to the Park Plaza Parking Structure. Existing uses on these parcels include commercial office, medical office, restaurant, retail, and fitness center. The adjacent One Park Apartment complex located to the south and west of the structure, was not a part of the Reciprocal Access Agreement. Under the Reciprocal Access Agreement, Centre City Associates, Limited Commercial (CCAL-C), then owner of three of the six adjacent parcels, assumed responsibility for overseeing maintenance and operation of the parking structure and were reimbursed by the other property owners. Construction of the parking structure was completed in February 1984.

The Reciprocal Access Agreement for the Park Plaza Parking Structure had a term of 35 years and expired in December 2018. With this expiration, the City assumed financial responsibility for all maintenance and operational costs of the structure and issued a new contract to a professional parking management firm for routine maintenance activities.

In 2007, the City completed a Downtown Parking Management Study. This study included an inventory of existing parking facilities, analysis of existing and future parking demand and turnover, and an evaluation of management practices. The 2007 study provided a series of recommendations related to parking management, policies, operations, marketing, enforcement, revenue control, facilities, alternate modes of travel, and parking requirements. Two of the more notable recommendations from this study that have been implemented are provided below:

- Transfer Parking District management and enforcement functions from the City to a professional parking management firm (completed in September 2009 via Resolution No. 2016-216); and
- Expansion of the Parking District boundaries to encompass the area bounded by E Street to the north, Del Mar Avenue to the east, H Street to the south, and Garrett Avenue to the west (accomplished in October 2009 via Ordinance No. 3139)

The current Downtown Chula Vista Parking Management Study is the successor to the 2007 study.

Current Draft Downtown Chula Vista Parking Management Plan

The City circulated Request for Proposal P21-1718 for the current Downtown Chula Vista Parking Management Study in April 2018 and after careful consideration of responses from four qualified consultants by an interdepartmental City review panel, the contract was awarded to Chen Ryan Associates via Resolution No. 2018-179 in August 2018. The objectives of the study are as follows:

- Develop a more holistic understanding of public parking demand within the Parking District, accounting for how the demand varies spatially, temporally, and is specific to various destinations within the study area
- Assess the City's parking infrastructure and operational practices
- Forecast near-term parking demand within the project study area based on historical growth patterns
- Provide recommendations to efficiently utilize parking resources and manage future parking demand

Data collection, including a parking inventory, occupancy counts, and a series of in-person and on-line surveys of Parking District users, was completed primarily during the summer and fall of 2018 and the results were documented in the Existing Conditions Report, which was completed in June 2019. Subsequent data collection and surveys were completed in November 2019 in connection with the Norman Park Senior Center. The parking data and surveys, conducted prior to statewide stay-at-home orders in connection with the COVID-19 global pandemic, remain valid for the purposes of the study and its recommendations. Since most businesses were closed during the stay-at-home orders, parking patterns were significantly disrupted; therefore, the data from 2018 and 2019 is more typical of normal operations within the Parking District.

Parking demand analysis in the Downtown PMP showed that there is adequate parking supply for existing conditions. "Adequate" parking supply reflects no more than 85% occupancy within a 1/8-mile radius. The future parking demand was estimated based on a review of entitled projects in the Parking District and a projection of potential development. If redevelopment occurs as modeled in this analysis, approximately 200 spaces would need to be accommodated in the future. The recommendations in the Downtown PMP support this eventuality through the increase in parking fees and re-evaluation of the in-lieu fees that will contribute to the construction of a future parking structure.

Given the expiration of the Reciprocal Access Easement for the Park Plaza Parking Structure, the City engaged a structural engineer in 2019 to evaluate the integrity of the parking structure and conducted additional research and analysis to estimate short-term and long-terms costs associated with operating the structure.

Local businesses within the Parking District were severely impacted by the closure of indoor spaces brought on by public health restrictions in response to the COVID-19 pandemic. To minimize economic impacts to businesses the City allowed businesses to provide Curb Cafés. Since this was a significant change within the Parking District during the timeframe of the study, the City conducted a series of surveys to track the

development and evolution of the Curb Café² program along Third Avenue to document its effect on parking supply. The Curb Café program has a sunset date of July 31, 2023, and the Downtown PMP provides a series of recommendations if the City considers extending the sunset date. This analysis is included in Chapter 5 of the Downtown PMP. The City also commissioned research and analysis on Electric Vehicle (EV) use in Chula Vista, the South Bay, and San Diego County to project EV parking demand and to develop criteria for the siting of EV charging stations in the Downtown area (see Chapter 6 of the Downtown PMP).

Community Engagement

Starting in January 2019, City staff engaged with various community stakeholders within the Parking District throughout the study process, including the business and landowners adjacent to the Park Plaza Parking Structure. Staff held in-person and virtual meetings with updates to the various stakeholders as the study was being prepared and finalized. Staff met with the Norman Park Senior Center in 2020 to provide the preliminary recommendations for the parking lot adjacent to the center.

Additionally, staff engaged with the Downtown Chula Vista Association, formerly known as the Third Avenue Village Association (“TAVA”), starting in 2019 and continuing through the most recent meetings, held on June 13, 2022 and July 6, 2022. Staff discussed the study approach early in the process with the Downtown Chula Vista Association Parking Subcommittee and at their Annual Meeting. Additionally, staff has presented the Downtown PMP to the Downtown Chula Vista Association’s Land Use Committee and Board of Directors.

CONCLUSION

Staff is requesting implementation of Recommendations Number 1, 9 and 11 with acceptance of the Downtown PMP. Recommendation Number 1 will allow all parking meters within the Parking District to be replaced with Smart Meters. This update of meters provides more convenience for users and easier enforcement. Additionally, to streamline the implementation of Recommendation Number 1, staff is also requesting that the City Manager, or designee, be authorized to enter into an agreement for the purchase or lease of Smart Meters. Recommendation Number 9 will allow the City to promptly remove the parking meters located at the Norman Park Senior Center Parking Lot. These meters will be replaced by signage allowing for time parking up to 4 hours in this lot. Increasing the time allotment is more compatible with the programs offered at this location serving Seniors. Recommendation Number 11 allows the City to expand the boundary of the Parking District to include the metered spaces north of E Street, on Garrett Avenue and Landis Avenue, thereby containing all metered parking spaces within the Parking District. The additional metered space locations are reflected in Attachment 2 of this Report.

The Downtown PMP contains the following recommendations:

Recommendations	Rationale	Benefits
1. Convert All Parking District Meters (Except Norman Park) to Smart Meters	Current parking meters do not accept more convenient forms of payment (credit card), thereby discouraging some users.	Increases the utility of parking meter infrastructure, is more convenient for users and provides easier enforcement.

² Outdoor dining areas within the public right-of-way for restaurants, bars, and breweries. The Curb Café structures temporarily replace existing metered spaces along Third Avenue in accordance with Ordinance No. 3508, which modified CVMC Section 12.28.30.

Recommendations	Rationale	Benefits
2. Shift Parking Enforcement Time from 9 AM – 6 PM to 10 AM - 8 PM	The current hours of parking enforcement do not coincide with the operating hours of most businesses along Third Avenue.	Facilitates parking turnover between 6 PM and 8 PM and encourages use by patrons/shoppers.
3. Increase Parking User Fees: Meters: \$0.75/hour Surface Lots: \$0.50/hour	Current parking user fees are insufficient to support credit card payments.	Provides sufficient revenue to support credit card payments and optimizes parking turnover.
4. Update Wayfinding and Information Signage within the Parking District	Parking information signage within Parking District is limited and inconsistent.	Improved information about parking locations and availability for visiting motorists.
5. Revise Downtown In-Lieu Parking Fee Program	Existing In-Lieu Parking Fee program does not meet the needs of expected costs of providing for future parking demand.	Aligns In-Lieu Parking Fee program with costs of providing for future parking demand.
6. Facilitate Non-Vehicular Transportation Modes to the Parking District	Limited end-of-trip facilities for bicycles and micro-mobility and limited pedestrian and transit stop amenities within Parking District.	Facilitates usage of other forms of transportation to access destinations within the Parking District, reducing parking demand.
7. Park Plaza Parking Structure Improvements and Maintenance Institute parking fees: \$0.50/hour	The City is now responsible for Park Plaza parking structure maintenance and repairs.	Provides funding for maintenance and operation and to make improvements to the largest parking facility within the Parking District. Facilitates parking turn-over.
8. Curbside Management	Lack of short-term parking and commercial loading locations along Third Avenue.	Accommodates a variety of users, each with varying peak demand times. Reduces double-parking along Third Avenue.
9. Modify Parking Restrictions at Norman Park Senior Center Parking Lot Remove meters, increase time limit to 4 hours.	Current time restrictions (two hours) are not compatible with Norman Park Senior Center activities.	Facilitate access to and use of the center.
10. Demand Management Plans for Large Events	Event attendees may not be aware of parking locations for large public events held in Downtown Chula Vista.	Increases utilization of available parking spaces. Improves event attendee perception of parking within the Parking District. Reduces congestion from motorists searching for parking spaces.

Recommendations	Rationale	Benefits
11. Expansion of Parking District Boundary to include all existing parking meters	Approximately 21 parking meters are located to the north of the Parking District boundaries, but which are managed in the same manner as meters inside the Parking District.	All meters are encompassed within the Parking District, facilitating management.
12. Establish funding mechanisms to accommodate future demand.	Approximately 200 additional spaces will be needed in the future if redevelopment occurs as projected.	Implementation of capital reserve fund and recommended changes to the in-lieu fee program will contribute to the construction of future parking facilities.
13. Monitor and make minor adjustments to the Curb Café program if it is extended beyond the July 31, 2023 sunset date.	Review of implementation and impacts identified several measures to improve administration of the program. Continued monitoring is suggested to address effects on parking availability and to ensure Curb Cafés remain attractive and structurally sound.	Monitoring will help avoid potential parking availability impacts and other recommendations will clarify operation of the program.
14. Provide additional Electric Vehicle Charging Stations (EVCS) in public parking lots and monitor EVCS use.	The City is committed to achieve its Greenhouse Gas (GHG) emission reduction goals and wants to support and encourage the use of electric vehicles. Additional charging stations are needed to accommodate expected increase in demand.	Establishes EVCS siting criteria, technical specifications, and monitoring procedures to support future EVCS installation and operation.

Next Steps

Staff will implement Recommendations Number 1, 9 and 11 with acceptance of the Downtown PMP and work on sequencing the remaining recommendations contained in the Downtown PMP. Staff will return to City Council for consideration of follow-up actions, as appropriate.

DECISION-MAKER CONFLICT

Staff has reviewed the property holdings of the City Council and has found that Mayor Casillas Salas has real property holdings within 500 feet of the boundaries of the property which is the subject of this action. This includes the proposed expanded boundary of the Parking District as well. Consequently, pursuant to California Code of Regulations Title 2, sections 18700 and 18702.2(a)(7), this item presents a disqualifying real property-related financial conflict of interest under the Political Reform Act (Cal. Gov't Code § 87100, *et seq.*) for the above-identified member. Staff is not independently aware and has not been informed by any City Council member, of any other fact that may constitute a basis for a decision-maker conflict of interest in this matter.

CURRENT-YEAR FISCAL IMPACT

There are no current year fiscal impacts to the General Fund or Development Services Fund as a result of this action. All revenues for the district are held in a Parking Meter Fund that is separate from the General Fund.

It is anticipated that implementing actions with any costs associated will be accommodated within the Parking Meter Fund.

ONGOING FISCAL IMPACT

There are no ongoing fiscal impacts to the General Fund or Development Services Fund as a result of this action. All revenues for the district are held in a Parking Meter Fund that is separate from the General Fund. It is anticipated that implementing actions with any costs associated will be accommodated within the Parking Meter Fund.

ATTACHMENTS

Attachment 1 – Downtown Chula Vista Parking Management Plan Report, dated August 2022

Attachment 2 - Existing Parking Supply Diagram

*Staff Contacts: Scott Barker, Transportation Engineer, Development Services
Laura C. Black, AICP, Interim Director, Development Services*